# A Combinatorial Result on Points and Circles on the Plane 

V. Neumann-Lara*<br>and<br>J. Urrutia**


#### Abstract

Let $P_{n}$ be a collection of $n$ points on the plane. For a pair of points $u$ and $v P_{n}$ let $C(u, v)$ be the minimum number of points of $P_{n}$ contained in any circle contaning $u$ and $v$. In this paper we prove the result that there exist two points $u_{0}$ and $v_{0} P_{n}$ such that any circle containing $u_{0}$ and $v_{0}$ contains at least $\square(n-2) / 60 \square$ elements of $P_{n}$ (other than $u_{0}$ and $v_{0}$ ). We also prove that the average value of $C(u, v)$ over all pairs $\{u, v\} P_{n}$ is $\geq \square(n-2) / 60 \square$ For the case when $P_{n}$ are the vertices of a convex polygon, we prove that there exist two vertices $u, v$ of $P_{n}$ such that any circle containing them contains at least $\square(n-2) / 4 \square$ elements of $P_{n}$.


* Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico, Instituto de Matemáticas.
**University of Ottawa, Department of Computer Science.


## Introduction

Geometry is one of the most interesting and important branches of mathemat- ics. The origins of geometry can be traced back to many ancient cultures, such as that of the Greeks. Some of the most important studies in geometry, such as the famous Elements of Euclid, deal simply with properties of collections of points, lines and circles on the plane. With the advent of combinatorics, new types of results in geometry are being obtained, results which involve the combinatorial properties of sets of points, lines and circles on the plane. See for example, [2], [5], [6], [11]. The interested reader can find an excellent source of results of this nature in Hadwiger, Debrunner and Klee's book Combinatorial Geometry on the Plane [10] and Grunbaum's Arrangements and Spreads [7].

In this paper, we prove the following result: Given a collection $P_{n}$ of $n$ points on the plane, there exist two points $u$, $v$ of $P_{n}$ such that any circle containing them contains at least $\left[\mathrm{n}-2 / 60 \square\right.$ points in $P_{n}$. Furthermore let $C(u, v)$ be the minimum number of points of $P_{n}$ contained in any circle containing $u$ and $v ; u, v$ $\square P_{n}$. Then we prove that the average value of $C(u, v)$ over all pairs $\{u, v\} \square P_{n}$ is at least $[\mathrm{n}-2 / 60 \square$. The proof of this result uses basic results in combinatorics and graph theory.

For the sake of clarity, all collections $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}$ of points considered in the rest of this paper do not contain any three aligned points. This restriction can be easily lifted, leaving the results of this paper unchanged.

## Preliminaries

A graph $G=(V(G), E(G))$ consists of a collection of points $V(G)$ called the vertices of $G$ and a set $E(G)$ of unordered pairs of elements of $V(G)$ called the edges of $G$. If the pair $\{u, v\}$ belongs to $E(G)$, we say that $u$ and $v$ are adjacent. An edge $\{u, v\}$ will be denoted by $u-v$. We say that $u-v$ joins $u$ to $v$. In this paper, we will deal with representations of graphs on the plane. In these representations, the vertices of G are represented by points on the plane, and the edges $u-v$ of $G$ by open segments of lines joining the points $u$ and $v$. Let $\operatorname{Bin}(r, s)$ denote the binomial coefficient of $r$ and $s$.

A complete graph $K_{n}$ is a graph with $n$ vertices such that for any pair of
vertices $u$, $v$ of $V\left(K_{n}\right)$, $u-v$ is an edge of $K_{n}$. The following well-known result of graph theory will be used:

Theorem 0: Any planar representation of $\mathrm{K}_{5}$ contains two edges which intersect at a point $p$ not a vertex of $\mathrm{K}_{5}$.
For a pair of points $u$ and $v$ on the plane let $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v})$ be the open segment of line joining $u$ to $v$. The following lemma will prove useful in the proof of our main result.

Lemma 1: Let $\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}, \mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}$ be points in the plane such that $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v})$ and $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ intersect. Then any circle containing $u$ and $v$ contains at least one end point of $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ or any circle containing x and y contains at least one end point of $I(u, v)$.

Proof: It is easy to see that $\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}, \mathrm{x}$ and y form the vertices of a convex quadrilateral. (See Figure 1.)


Figure 1.
In any such quadrilateral there exist two internal opposite angles such that their sum is greater than or equal to $180^{\circ}$. Without loss of generality let us assume that it is the angles of $u$ and $v$ that satisfy this property. Then any circle containing $x$ and $y$ contains at least one of $u$ or $v$.

Let $P_{n}$ be a collection of $n$ points on the plane. An imbedding of $K_{n}$ on the plane can be obtained by representing the vertices of $K_{n}$ with the points of $P_{n}$ and the edges of $K_{n}$ with the segments $I(u, v), u \neq v, u, v \square P_{n}$.

Let us define $I\left(P_{n}\right)$, the intersection number of $P_{n}$ as follows: $I\left(P_{n}\right)$ is the number of different segments $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}), \mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ such that $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}) \square \mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}) \neq \varnothing$; $\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}, \mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}$ $\square P_{n}$.

Lemma 2: $I\left(P_{n}\right) \geq \operatorname{Bin}(n, 5) /(n-4)$.

Proof: By Theorem 0, for each subset $S$ of $P_{n}$ with exactly five elements, there exist four points $u, v, x, y \square S$ such that $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}) \square \mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}) \neq \varnothing$. Furthermore, the subset $\{\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}, \mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y}\}$ appears in exactly $n-4$ subsets of $P_{n}$ with five elements.

Finally, let us define a graph $G\left(P_{n}\right)$ (the intersection graph of $P_{n}$ ) as follows: $V\left(G\left(P_{n}\right)\right)=\left\{(u, v) ; u, v \square P_{n}, u \neq v\right\}$ and two vertices $I(u, v), I(x, y)$ of $G\left(P_{n}\right)$ are adjacent if $I(u, v) \square I(x, y) \neq \emptyset$. See Figure 2.


Figure 2.
Clearly $G\left(P_{n}\right)$ has exactly $I\left(P_{n}\right)$ edges, one for each pair of intersecting segments $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}), \mathrm{I}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$.

Corollary 1: $\left|\mathrm{E}\left(\mathrm{G}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)\right)\right| \geq \operatorname{Bin}(\mathrm{n}, 5) /(\mathrm{n}-4)$.
We now obtain an orientation $\mathrm{G}^{*}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ of $\mathrm{G}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ as follows: An edge $\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v})-\mathrm{l}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ is oriented $I(u, v) \rightarrow I(x, y)$ if any circle containing $u$ and $v$ contains $x$ or $y$, otherwise we orient $I(x, y)->\mid(u, v)$. This orientation is consistent because of Lemma 1. We should notice that if $u, v, x$ and $y$ lie on a circle, then we could choose either orientation; $|(u, v)->|(x, y)$ or $l(x, y)->\mid(u, v)$.

Let $d^{+}(u)$ be the out-degree of a vertex $u$ in a directed graph $D$, ie. the number of vertices $x$ such that $u->x \square E(D)$.

Lemma 3: There exists a vertex $\mathrm{I}\left(\mathrm{u}_{0}, \mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{o}}\right)$ of $\mathrm{V}\left(\mathrm{G}^{*}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)\right)$ such that
$d^{+}\left(I\left(u_{0}, v_{0}\right)\right) \geq \square(n-2)(n-3) / 60 \square$
Proof: From Corollary $1,\left|E\left(G^{*}\left(P_{n}\right)\right)\right| \geq \operatorname{Bin}(n, 5) /(n-4)$.
We also know that

$$
\sum \mathrm{d}^{+}(\mid(u, v))=\left|E\left(\mathrm{G}^{*}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)\right)\right|
$$

Then

$$
\sum \mathrm{d}^{+}(\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v})) \geq \operatorname{Bin}(\mathrm{n}, 5) /(\mathrm{n}-4) .
$$

Since we have exactly $\operatorname{Bin}(n, 2)$ vertices in $\mathrm{G}^{*}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$, there exists a vertex I ( $u_{0}, v_{0}$ ) with

$$
d^{+}\left(I\left(u_{0}, v_{o}\right)\right) \geq[\operatorname{Bin}(n, 5) /(n-4)] / \operatorname{Bin}(n, 2)=(n-2)(n-3) / 60
$$

## Results

We are now ready to prove our main result.
Theorem 1: For any collection $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}$ of n points on the plane, there exists a pair of points $u_{0}, v_{0}$ such that any circle containing them contains at least $|n-2 / 60|$ points of $P_{n}$.

Proof: By Lemma 3, there exist two points, $u_{0}, v_{o} P_{n}$ such that $d^{+}\left(I\left(u_{o}, v_{0}\right)\right) \geq(n-2)(n-3) / 60$. This means that there exist at least $\square(n-2)(n-3) / 60 \square$ segments $I(x, y), x, y \square P_{n}$ such that any circle containing $u_{0}$ and $v_{0}$ contains one end point of each one of these $(\mathrm{n}-2)(\mathrm{n}-3) / 60$ segments. Eliminating redundancies (each point could appear in at most $\mathrm{n}-3$ such segments), we have that any circle containing $u_{0}$ and $v_{o}$ contains at least $\square(n-2) / 60 \square$ points of $P_{n}$ different from $u_{0}$ and $v_{0}$.

In Lemma 3, we showed that there exists a vertex $I(u, v)$ in $G\left(P_{n}\right)$ with $d^{+}(I(u, v)) \geq(n-2)(n-3) / 60$. Using the same arguments as for Lemma 3, we can obtain the following corollary.

Corollary 2: The average out-degree $d^{+}(\mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v})), \mathrm{I}(\mathrm{u}, \mathrm{v}) \square \mathrm{V}\left(\mathrm{G}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)\right)$ is greater than or equal to $(\mathrm{n}-2)(\mathrm{n}-3) / 60$.

For a pair of points $u, v \square P_{n}$, let $C(u, v)$ be the minimum number of points of
$P_{n}$ that are contained in any circle containing $u$ and $v$. Let $A\left(P_{n}\right)$ be the average over all $C(u, v), u, v \square P_{n}$. A result which is much stronger than Theorem 1 now follows:

Theorem 2: $A\left(P_{n}\right) \geq(n-2) / 60$.
For the special case when $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}$ are the vertices of a convex polygon, we can prove the following result:

Theorem 3: Let P be a convex polygon. Then there exist two vertices u and $v$ of $P$ such that any circle containing them contains at least $\square(n-2) / 4 \square$ vertices of $P$.

Proof: We prove the theorem for the case when $n=2 k$; the case $n=2 k+1$ can be proved in a similar way. Let us label the vertices of $P$ by $0,1, \ldots, n-$ 1 by tracing the boundary of P in the clockwise direction (see Figure 3).


Figure 3.
Let G be the intersection graph of the segments of lines joining opposite pairs of vertices of $P$, ie. $V(G)=\{l(i, i+1)$; $i+k \bmod n\}$. Let $G$ be the orientation obtained from G by orienting the edges of G using the same rules as in Theorem 1. Then the average outdegree in $G$ is $(k-1) / 2=(n-$ 2)/4. The result now follows as in Theorem 1.

However this bound is not very tight. For all polygons $P$ we have tried, we have been able to find two opposite vertices such that any circle containing
them contains at least half of the vertices of $P$. This suggests the following problem:

Problem 1: Show that in any convex polygon P with n vertices, there exist two opposite vertices $u$ and $v$ such that any circle containing them contains at least half of the vertices of $P$.

## Final Remarks

An interesting problem is to study how tight the bounds proved in Theorems 1,2 and 3 are. For example, for small values of $n$ (namely $n<60$ ), the results proved in Theorem 1 are far from optimal. In fact, if $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}$ contains five points, we can always find two elements of $P_{n}$ such that any circle containing them contains at least a third point in $P_{n}$. However, for large values of $n$, the bound of Theorem 3 may not be far from optimal. Blazek and Koman [1] and Guy [9] have shown that there exist collections of points $P_{n}$ such that $\mathrm{I}\left(\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}\right) \leq 1 / 4 \square \mathrm{n} / 2 \square(\mathrm{n}-1) / 2 \square(\mathrm{n}-2) / 2 \square(\mathrm{n}-3) / 2 \square$ which is approximately three times as large as $\operatorname{Bin}(n, 5) /(n-4)$. This suggests that for some collections, we could have $A\left(P_{n}\right)$ less than or equal to $n / 20$.

We should also mention that Theorem 1 is not valid if $P_{n}$ is a collection of points in the $2 d$-dimensional space $\mathbb{R}^{2 d}$.

Let $B(t)=\left(t, t^{2}, \ldots, t^{2 d}\right)$ and $P_{n}=\left\{B\left(\mathrm{t}_{\mathrm{i}}\right) ; 0<\mathrm{t}_{1}<\mathrm{t}_{2}<\ldots<\mathrm{t}_{\mathrm{n}}\right\}$. This curve, called the momentum curve, was first discovered by Carathéodory [3], [4]. In [8] (pages 61-62) the following result is proved:

Theorem 4: For any $k$-pointed subset $A$ of $P_{n}, k \leq d$ there exists a supporting hyperplane $H$ of the convex hull of $P_{n}$ such that $H \square P_{n}=A$.

As a consequence of this result, we can easily prove the following:
Theorem 5: For any subset $A$ of $P_{n}$ with $|A| \leq d$, there exists a $2 d$ dimensional sphere $S(A)$ containing all elements of $A$ such that $\mathrm{S}(\mathrm{A}) \square \mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}=\mathrm{A}$.
This suggests the following problem:
Problem 2: Find $\mathrm{f}(\mathrm{d})$ and $\mathrm{g}(\mathrm{d})$ such that the following holds:

For any collection $P_{n}$ of $n$ points in $\mathbb{R}$ there exists a subset $S$ of $P_{n}$ with $f(d)$ points such that any $d$-sphere containing $S$ contains at least $n / g(d)$ elements in $\mathrm{P}_{\mathrm{n}}$.

## References

[1] J. Blazek and N. Koman, A minimal problem concerning complete plane graphs, in: Theory of Graphs and its Applications, ed., M. Fiedler, (Czechoslovak Academy of Sciences, Prague, 1964) 113-117.
[2] N. G. De Bruijn and P. Erdös, On a combinatorial problem, Indagationes Math. 10 (1948) 421-423.
[3] C. Carathéodory, Über den Variabilitätsbereich der Koeffizienten von Potenzreihen, die gegebene Werte nicht annehmen, Math. Ann. 64 (1907) 95-115.
[4] C. Carathéodory, Über den Variabilitätsbereich der Fourierschen Konstanten von positiven harmonischen Funktionen, Rend. Civc. Math. Palermo, 32 (1911) 193-217.
[5] H. S. M. Coxeter, A problem of collinear points, Amer. Math. Monthly 55 (1948) 26-28.
[6] P. Erdös, Problem No. 4065, Amer. Math. Monthly 55 (1944) 169-171.
[7] B. Grunbaum, Arrangements and Spreads, Regional Conference Series in Mathematics 10. A. M. S.
[8] B. Grunbaum, Convex Polytopes, Interscience, London. 1967.
[9] R. K. Guy, The decline and fall of Zarankiewie's theorem, in: Proof Techniques in Graph Theory, ed., F. Horary, (Academic Press, New York, 1969) 63-69.
[10]Hadwiger and Debrunner, Combinatorial Geometry in the Plane, tr., v. Klee (Holt, Reinhart and Winston, 1964).
[11] J. J. Sylvester, Problem 11,851, Math Questions and Solutions from the Educational Tlme, 59 (1893) 98-99.

